

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
DISTRICT OF MINNESOTA**

---

William Eldredge,

Court File No: 09-2018 (SRN/JSM)

Plaintiff,

v.

City of Saint Paul and  
Saint Paul Department of Fire and Safety Services,

Defendants.

---

**ORDER ON PLAINTIFF'S MOTION TO EXCLUDE NEEDLESS  
PRESENTATION OF CUMULATIVE AND IRRELEVANT MEDICAL  
EVIDENCE**

---

The above-entitled matter came on for hearing before the Honorable Susan Richard Nelson on September 16, 2011 on Plaintiff's Motion to Exclude Needless Presentation of Cumulative and Irrelevant Medical Evidence [Doc. No. 247]. For the reasons set forth herein, Plaintiff's motion is denied without prejudice.

Plaintiff seeks to exclude cumulative testimony from a number of doctors identified by Defendants as trial witnesses. Defendants have identified three medical expert witnesses and propose to call seven more doctors as witnesses. Defendants oppose this motion.

The Court will not rule on the admissibility of the proposed testimony until it is proffered. The Court cautions the parties that they should be careful not to introduce cumulative evidence.

Based on all the files, records and proceedings herein, including the arguments of counsel, IT IS HEREBY ORDERED:

1. Plaintiff's Motion to Exclude Needless Presentation of Cumulative and Irrelevant Medical Evidence [Doc. No. 247] is **DENIED WITHOUT PREJUDICE**.

Dated: Sept. 16, 2011

BY THE COURT:

s/Susan Richard Nelson  
Judge Susan Richard Nelson  
District Court Judge